

## ALTERNATIVE CORONET SELECTION – A Comparison

Types of Selection	Sub-type	Inclusivity Rating A: most D: least	Spectacle Rating A: easiest D: most work req	Advantages	Disadvantages	Mitigations	Feedback S1 = First Survey
<b>Martial</b>	Rattan	D 16% of members are auth heavies	A Pageantry frisson, heraldry, ceremonies etc already in place	Most familiar, traditional Most likely to gain approval as stand-alone Clear-cut contest Usually acts as eligibility criterion (ie prowess=SCA familiarity) Defined role for consort	Not inclusive Inappropriate selection mechanism for leaders Lack of representation of other aspects of SCA life Likely dominance of certain fighters/SG	Targeted pre-selection requirements (eg governance, service,A&S)  Strengthen other areas, training	<b>S1:</b> 27% wanted heavy only; 58% opposed <b>SI:</b> 71% liked/wanted an alternative (of which 22% would only support an alternative)
	Rapier	D 10% of members are auth rapier	A	Ready add-on using rattan traditions Role for consort	Not inclusive Inappropriate selection mechanism for leaders Lack of representation of other aspects of SCA life Darton likely dominant		-
	Combat archery	D- 3%	C		Very limited number of participants (6) No consort tradition		-
	Target archery	B Estimate 24%	C	Much wider field of possible participants in this martial form	No consort tradition Somewhat harder to create spectacle around it	Develop ceremonies/consort aspects	-
	Champion (fights for two patrons)	A-	A	Opens up to anyone able to convince/support a heavy to fight for them; allows non-Crown-interested fighters to participate Period-style spectacle options	(Manageable) potential for uncomfortable commercial/financial aspects, might be too easy for no-SCA-experience patrons to rule Still rattan reliant	Rules about payment/support etc, time-in etc qualifications for patrons	-

<b>Lottery</b>		A	D A positive for some.	No-blame outcome Easy to explain Can't stack	Very random Hard to dress up	Needs good pre-selection criteria Mediate with Venetian	<b>S1:</b> 19% supported lottery
<b>Poll/Vote</b>		A	C	Familiar system, version currently used in B&B selection, but with Crown involvement	Potential for populist or clique capture, household-biased	Crown mediation? Mediate with Venetian	<b>S1:</b> 35% support
<b>Venetian (Mix of lottery and vote)</b>		A-?	C	Can combine the best elements of lottery and poll/vote	Unfamiliar, complex to explain and to do	Lots of discussion required, fine-tuning	-
<b>Rotation</b>				Variety, can explore different aspects of SCA interests; chance to test what works	Would there be any relationship between selection form and leadership?		<b>S1:</b> 59% liked some form of undefined rotation
	Triple prowess (rattan, rapier, target archery)	C	B+	Simple martial extension	More inclusive but still ableist		<b>S1:</b> 32% supported triple prowess
	Martial + Venetian	B+?	C	Caters for variety, especially if Venetian alternates with each martial option	Long cycle for martial options (7 terms if Venetian interleaved)		-
	Populace chooses next method each time	A-D	A-C	Popular/democratic choice	Complex, might be subject to a shift <i>against</i> inclusivity if the populace doesn't like certain forms	Do well in advance for planning/prep	See Wild Card option

<b>A&amp;S</b>		B-D	C	Covers a broad range of SCA activities, can cycle through categories as per current Kingdom A&S	Difficulty with categories and esp judging! Traditionally low participation Professional artisans vs amateurs Inclusivity depends on nature of category How to make judging/results interesting? No consort role?		-
<b>Games</b>	Informal ie random selection by bean, custard eating etc	B?	C	Simple approach Non-serious option	Lowers status of role, likely not equal recognition by others		-
	Competitive eg Chess, backgammon	B	D	Competition with clear outcome that doesn't require physical capabilities	Could take a long time for a full-scale tourney, may lower status per Bean	Run pre-tourneys with a final	-
<b>Wild card</b>	Format proposed and voted on at each tourney (for the next one)	A-D - could require a rating of A-B for a proposed format to go forward	D	Allowing for new ideas and formats Voted on by populace so more consultative	Requires clear explanation of format	Could be run as part of voted rotational system Require proposer to be involved in stewarding if successful to reduce troll bids	-